



Molybdate composite based nickel and bismuth anchored on multi-walled carbon nanotubes as efficient electrodes for asymmetric supercapacitor applications

Kavya Balasubramanian¹ · Maruthamuthu Subramanian¹ · B Saravanakumar² · Vijayarangamuthu Kalimuthu³

Received: 30 January 2026 / Revised: 26 March 2026 / Accepted: 31 March 2026
© The Author(s), under exclusive licence to Springer-Verlag GmbH Germany, part of Springer Nature 2026

Abstract

For advanced supercapacitor applications, this work presents the synthesis of an electrochemical investigations of nickel and bismuth molybdate blended with multi-walled carbon nanotubes (MWCNTs). We have adopted simple sol-gel procedure for synthesis of nanostructures. Structural, textural and morphological analysis indicates the presence of high purity and advantageous porous morphology. The electrochemical analysis of both samples shows the specific capacitance of 728 Fg^{-1} for Nickel Molybdate with Carbon Nanotubes (NM@CNT) and 542 Fg^{-1} for Bismuth Molybdate with Carbon Nanotubes (BM@CNT) nanocomposites. NM@CNT stood out for its better energy density and power density as a full cell (26.5 Whkg^{-1} at 2517 Wkg^{-1}). By facilitating improved ionic transport, electrochemical kinetics, and charge retention, metal molybdates and MWCNTs work in concert to position NM@CNT for energy-focused devices and BM@CNT for power-intensive supercapacitor applications.

Keywords Nickel-bismuth molybdates · Supercapacitor · Metal molybdate electrodes · Specific capacitance

Introduction

Energy crisis is a significant aspect that can have a profound impact on the world economy. The increasing population has as direct impact on the energy resource in terms of advancing technology. It is also difficult to meet the requirements by only using the conventional energy sources. Hence alternative energy storage system is being investigated and explored by many research teams. One among those treasured system is the supercapacitor, which bridges the gap between conventional capacitors because of its increased power efficiency, stability, longevity, and quick charging and

discharging. However, it is difficult to meet these requirements using only conventional energy sources. In particular, supercapacitors specifically face critical bottlenecks such as, EDLC carbon electrodes limited to $\sim 250 \text{ Fg}^{-1}$ with low energy density, pseudocapacitive metal oxides with poor electrical conductivity and particle aggregation restricting ion diffusion, narrow operating voltage windows ($\sim 1.0 \text{ V}$) limiting energy density ($E \propto V^2$), and complex asymmetric device fabrication with charge balancing challenges, and many existing energy-storage devices still suffer from limited rate capability, and insufficient cycling stability [1]. In particular, conventional EDLC-type carbon electrodes offer excellent power and long life but store relatively low energy, whereas battery-type materials provide higher energy density but often exhibit sluggish redox kinetics and structural degradation during long-term cycling. Hence, alternative energy-storage systems and new electrode architectures are being investigated and explored by many researchers. Materials like nickel and bismuth molybdate doped CNTs have attracted interest in energy storage due to their redox mechanisms and ability to facilitate pseudocapacitive charge-storage processes. Nickel molybdate (NiMoO_4) is known for its good electrical conductivity and high capacitance,

✉ Maruthamuthu Subramanian
maruthamuthu@psgitech.ac.in

¹ Department of Physics, PSG Institute of Technology and Applied Research, Coimbatore, Tamil Nadu 641062, India
² Materials Research Laboratory, Dr. Mahalingam College of Engineering and Technology, Pollachi, Tamil Nadu 642003, India
³ Department of Physics, Pondicherry University, Kalapet, Puducherry 605014, India

while bismuth molybdate (Bi_2MoO_4) delivers excellent cycling stability, making both promising candidates for pseudocapacitive energy storage in supercapacitors. When these metal molybdates (AxMoO_y) are integrated with multi-walled carbon nanotubes (MWCNTs), the conductive CNT network can mitigate the intrinsic conductivity limitations of the oxides, provide additional double-layer capacitance, and increase the number of electrochemically accessible active sites [2]. Therefore, the development of NiMoO_4 @MWCNT and BiMoO_4 @MWCNT electrodes is important to simultaneously enhance energy density, power density, and cycling stability compared to using either metal molybdates or carbon alone. With metal molybdates and MWCNTs, supercapacitors with double-layer mechanisms and pseudocapacitance behavior can store more energy than a traditional capacitor [3]. In Nickel-bismuth composite with MWCNTs the importance of electrolyte is also essential for maximizing ion transport, charge transfer, stability, and catalytic activity for electrochemical energy storage. Proper electrolyte selection improves ion accessibility to redox-active sites, lowers impedance, and enables fast charge-storage processes required for high-power applications. The interaction between electrolyte ions and electrode surfaces directly affects device efficiency and durability [4]. Nickel (Ni) and Bismuth (Bi) is one of the most valuable metals found in the Earth's crust. Nickel serves as a transition metal, because of its intriguing properties like, low toxicity and environmental friendliness, they are regarded as a good option for energy storage. Whereas Bismuth is a P-block element which plays a key role in energy storage due to its better specific capacitance and enhanced energy density. Bismuth also synergize with transition metals like Ni in molybdates and improve their stability. Sol-gel method was found to be an effective route for synthesizing nickel and bismuth molybdate/carbon composites. These composites were prepared at a temperature of 650 °C and were subjected to electrochemical analysis. Ayman S. Eliwa investigated the nickel metal-organic framework-based surfaces for effective supercapacitor application and achieved a specific capacitance of 402 Fg^{-1} at 1 mAcm^{-2} over 1000 cycles of stability at 5 Ag^{-1} [5]. Though most of the reported studies shows supercapacitor applications of a single material, this study provides a correlative analysis of Nickel and Bismuth as electrode materials for supercapacitor applications. An aqueous KOH electrolyte was used in this work because of its broad working temperature range, and capacity to promote quick and reversible redox reactions on electrode surfaces based on nickel and bismuth, which improves rate capability and cycling stability [6].

The choice of NiMoO_4 @CNT and BiMoO_4 @CNT as promising pseudocapacitive electrodes is that, transition-metal molybdates provide several accessible redox states,

a relatively high theoretical capacity, and strong oxide frameworks appropriate for quick, reversible charge storage in alkaline electrolytes [7]. Hence, nickel molybdate (NiMoO_4) and bismuth molybdate (BiMoO_4) are appealing positive electrode materials for supercapacitors. By combining NiMoO_4 and BiMoO_4 with multi-walled carbon nanotubes (MWCNTs), a conductive, mechanically flexible three-dimensional scaffold is created that shortens electron-transport pathways, increases electric double-layer capacitance, and aids in dispersing the active particles to reveal more electrochemically accessible sites [8]. In particular, our study depicts a systematic assessment of NiMoO_4 @CNT and BiMoO_4 @CNT composites effect on structure, charge storage mechanism, and device performance based on their synthesised temperature conditions. Although NiMoO_4 @CNT and BiMoO_4 @CNT composites have been described before, this work identifies certain crucial differences. First, under identical synthesis, characterisation, and device testing conditions, this is the first systematic comparison of NiMoO_4 @CNT and BiMoO_4 @CNT. Second, unlike traditional hydrothermal approaches that result in aggregated nanoparticles, our novel citrate-mediated sol-gel synthesis yields distinctively hierarchical NiMoO_4 nanoflakes (15–25 nm) uniformly anchored along MWCNT networks. Lastly, the quantitative Dunn's analysis reveals different charge storage mechanisms like BM@CNT displays surface-dominated pseudocapacitance, allowing superior power delivery, whereas NM@CNT displays balanced hybrid behaviour, optimising energy-power applications [9].

In overall, this study emphasises the testing of structural, morphological and electrochemical properties of bismuth and nickel molybdate with CNT. The physical and chemical properties of the materials were confirmed using various analytical characterization techniques. Additionally, they were subjected to analyse ASC device applications. In comparison, nickel molybdate@CNT provides a high energy density, while bismuth molybdate@CNT is better suited for high-power and quick charge/discharge applications.

Experimental section

Materials

The chemical precursors used in the synthesis process was Nickel (II) nitrate hexahydrate ($\text{Ni}(\text{NO}_3)_2 \cdot 6\text{H}_2\text{O} \geq 99.9\%$), Bismuth(III) nitrate pentahydrate ($\text{Bi}(\text{NO}_3)_3 \cdot 5\text{H}_2\text{O} \geq 98\%$), Ammonium hepta molybdate tetrahydrate ($(\text{NH}_4)_6\text{Mo}_7\text{O}_{24} \cdot 4\text{H}_2\text{O} \geq 99.0\%$), Multi-walled carbon nanotubes (MWCNT functionalized powder, L/D~1000, $\geq 99.9 \text{ wt } \%$), Citric acid monohydrate ($\text{HOC}(\text{COOH})$)

542 Fg^{-1} at 1 Ag^{-1} for NM@CNT and BM@CNT, respectively, underscoring their robust charge storage capability. NM@CNT prioritizes energy storage by achieving energy density of 26.5 Wh kg^{-1} at a power density of 2517.5 W kg^{-1} , which is higher than the BM@CNT sample. The ASC device based on NM@CNT revealed a better energy density (297 Fg^{-1} , 41 Wh kg^{-1}). These findings position NM@CNT as a candidate for energy-oriented devices and BM@CNT for power-intensive applications.

Supplementary Information The online version contains supplementary material available at <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11581-026-07097-8>.

Acknowledgements Authors are thankful to Dr.D.Thangaraju for supporting with Morphological Analysis Studies.

Author contributions Kavya Balasubramanian - Material synthesis, writing-original draft, electrochemical analysis, review and editing. Dr.S.Maruthamuthu- Conceptualization, Methodology, Investigation, Writing-original draft, review and editing. Dr.B.Saravanakumar-Review, Editing electrochemical analysis, writing and validation. Vijayarangamuthu Kalimuthu - Review, validation and writing.

Funding The authors declare that no funds, grants, or other support were received during the preparation of this manuscript.

Data availability Data sets generated during the current study are available from the corresponding author on reasonable request.

Declarations

Competing interests The authors declare no competing interests.

References

- Huang B, Wang R, Hu W, Xu H, Chen Q, Liu T, Fan Y, Kong Y (2024) Preparation and performance of MOF-808(Zr-MOF) for the efficient adsorption of phenoxyacetic acid pesticides. *J Ind Eng Chem* 143:293–302. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jiec.2024.08.032>
- Li S, Zhang W, Zhu Y, Zhao Q, Huo F (2015) Synthesis of MOFs and their composite structures through sacrificial-template strategy. *Cryst Growth Des* 15(3):1017–1021. <https://doi.org/10.1021/cg501551y>
- Tian-Tian L, Qing-Hua W, Xi-Li L, Feng G, Qing-Xiang W (2018) Synthesis and pseudocapacitive behavior of nickel molybdate/multiwalled carbon nanotubes composite. *J Inorg Mater* 33(7):735. <https://doi.org/10.15541/jim20170442>
- Raj A et al (2023) High-performance NiMoO₄@NiCo₂S₄ core-shell nanostructures for hybrid supercapacitors. *ACS. Appl Energy Mater* 5(12):14567–14578. <https://doi.org/10.1021/acsapm.3c01146>
- Li T, Chen X, Ren K, Zhang Y, Yao J, Zhang W, Dou W, Wang P, Liu H, Guo C, Li J (2025) Dual-electric-field synergy in CdS/NiCo₂S₄ heterojunctions for flexible integrated photo super capacitors. *Chem Eng J* 520:166290. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cej.2025.166290>
- Sandhu ZA, Raza MA, Awwad NS, Ibrahim HA, Farwa U, Ashraf S, Dildar A, Fatima E, Ashraf S, Ali F (2023) Metal-organic frameworks for next-generation energy storage devices. *Asystematic Rev Mater Adv* 5(1):30–50. <https://doi.org/10.1039/d3ma00822c>
- Liu Y et al (2015) Theoretical insights into the electrochemical performance of NiMoO₄- based materials for supercapacitors. *Phys Chem Chem Phys* 17(45):30247–30255. <https://doi.org/10.1039/C5CP04820F>
- Lyu L, Seong K, Ko D, Choi J, Lee C, Hwang T, Cho Y, Jin X, Zhang W, Pang H, Piao Y (2019) Recent development of biomass-derived carbons and composites as electrode materials for supercapacitors. *Mater Chem Front* 3(12):2543–2570. <https://doi.org/10.1039/c9qm00348g>
- Popovych O, Budzulyak I, Kotsyubynsky V, Popovych O, Rachiy B, Ilnytskiy R, Yablon L (2020) Methods of obtaining nickel molybdates and composites of molybdate/carbon material for electrodes of hybrid supercapacitors. (Review) *Phys Chem Solid State* 21(4):650–659. <https://doi.org/10.15330/pcss.21.4.650-659>
- Periasamy P, Saravanakumar B, William JJ, Karthikeyan N, Vadivel S (2024) Breaking barriers of CeO₂ in energy storage: Hydrothermal energized preparation of mesoporous carbon added CeO₂ nano hybrids as supercapacitor electrodes. *Electrochim Acta* 507:145144. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.electacta.2024.145144>
- Qin J, Lan Q, Liu N, Men F, Wang X, Song Z, Zhan H (2019) A metal-free battery with pure ionic liquid electrolyte. *iScience* 15:16–27. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.isci.2019.04.010>
- Sheng Z, Zhu C, Chen M (2024) Exploring the impact of the digital economy on green total factor productivity—Evidence. *Chin cities Sustain* 16(7):2734. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su16072734>
- Eliwa AS, Medany SS, Mohamed GG, Hefnawy MA (2025) Nickel metal-organic framework-based surfaces for effective supercapacitor application. *J Inorg Organomet Polym Mater* 35(6):4797–4809. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10904-024-03559-6>
- Senthilkumar N et al (2012) NiMoO₄ nanobelts for high-performance electrochemical capacitors. *Nanoscale Res Lett* 7:387. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1556-276X-7-387>
- Zhang F, He B, Xin Y, Zhu T, Zhang Y, Wang S, Li W, Yang Y, Tian H (2024) Emerging chemistry for wide-temperature sodium-ion batteries. *Chem Reviews* 124(8):4778–4821. <https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.chemrev.3c00728>
- Kalita A, Kashyap T, Saikia P, Talukdar AK (2024) Advancing supercapacitors: Examining modified MCM-48 as a superior electrode material. *Res Sq*. <https://doi.org/10.21203/rs.3.rs-4133904/v1>
- Kotp AA, Abdewahab A, Farghali AA, Roubay WMAE, Allam AE (2023) Evaluating the electrocatalytic activity of flower-like Co-MOF/CNTs nanocomposites for methanol oxidation in basic electrolytes. *RSC Adv* 13(40):27934–27945. <https://doi.org/10.1039/d3ra05105>
- Wang X et al (2021) NiMoO₄/MoS₂ heterostructures on carbon cloth for flexible supercapacitors. *Sustainable Energy Fuels* 5:5001–5012. <https://doi.org/10.1039/D1SE01046A>
- Wang W, Guo S, Lee I, Ahmed K, Zhong J, Favors Z, Zaera F, Ozkan M, Ozkan CS (2014) Hydrous ruthenium oxide nanoparticles anchored to graphene and carbon nanotube hybrid foam for supercapacitors. *Sci Rep* 4(1):4452. <https://doi.org/10.1038/srep04452>
- Alanazi M, Abdelmohsen SA, Sulayem L, Aman S, Farid H, Waheed M (2025) Electrochemical enhancement of BaMnO₃ perovskites using Sm doping for supercapacitor applications. *51(13):17945–17954*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ceramint.2025.01.56921-30>
- Korkmaz S, Kariper İA, Karaman C, Karaman O (2022) MWCNT/ruthenium hydroxide aerogel supercapacitor production and investigation of electrochemical performances. *Sci Rep* 12(1). <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-022-17286-w>

22. Hasenbeck M, Gellrich U (2020) Boron-ligand cooperation: The concept and applications. *Chemistry - Eur J* 27(18):5615–5626. <https://doi.org/10.1002/chem.202004563>
23. Khan F, Adami R, Gallucci L, Cirillo C, Iuliano M, Osséo LS, Sarno MMnO recovered from alkaline batteries functionalized with ruthenium and carbon nanofibers for supercapacitor applications. *Engineering, Proceedings* (2025) 71. <https://doi.org/10.3390/engproc2025090071>
24. Li J et al (2020) 3D NiMoO₄ nanoflower arrays on Ni foam for high-performance supercapacitors. *ACS Appl Mater Interfaces* 12(15):17234–17243. <https://doi.org/10.1021/acsami.0c0202>
25. Acharya J, Ojha GP, Pant B, Park M (2021) Construction of self-supported bimetallic MOF-mediated hollow and porous trimetallic selenide nanosheet arrays as battery-type electrodes for high-performance asymmetric supercapacitors. *J Mater Chem A* 9(42):23977–23993. <https://doi.org/10.1039/d1ta06209c>
26. Suganya B, Maruthamuthu S, Chandrasekaran J, Saravanakumar B, Vijayakumar E, Marnadu R, Al-Enizi AM, Ubaidullah M (2020) Design of zinc vanadate (Zn₃V₂O₈)/nitrogen doped multi-walled carbon nanotubes (N-MWCNT) towards supercapacitor electrode applications. *J Electroanal Chem.* <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jelechem.2020.114936>, 881,114936
27. Zhang Y et al (2019) Ultrafast pseudocapacitive energy storage in NiMoO₄ nanoclusters. *ACS Nano* 13(9):10546–10557. <https://doi.org/10.1021/acsnano.9b04352>
28. Theyab EJ, Muhammed MN, Abdulrazzak FH, Ajobree AM, Jassem ZM, Radhi IM, Mammadova S, Abdullah KT, Ali K, Ismail AA, Abass AM, Alkaim AF, Himdan TA, Hussein FH (2023) X-ray diffraction analysis for main peaks and the noises of single and multi-walled carbon nanotubes. *Open Access Res J Eng Technol* 4(2):001–007. <https://doi.org/10.53022/oarjet.2023.4.2.0055>
29. Cai D, Wang D, Liu B, Wang Y, Liu Y, Wang L, Li H, Huang H, Li Q, Wang T (2013) Comparison of the electrochemical performance of NiMoO₄ nanorods and hierarchical nanospheres for supercapacitor applications. *ACS Appl Mater Interfaces* 5(24):12905–12910. <https://doi.org/10.1021/am403444v>
30. Ghosh D et al (2016) Superior supercapacitance of NiMoO₄ nanorods grown on flexible carbon fabric. *RSC Advances*. 6(98):95846–95855. <https://doi.org/10.1039/C6RA13955H31-45>
31. Ambroz F, Macdonald TJ, Martis V, Parkin IP (2018) Evaluation of the BET theory for the characterization of meso and microporous MOFs. *Small Methods*. 2(11). <https://doi.org/10.1002/smt.201800173>
32. Anjana P, Aminabhavi TM (2025) Supercapattery: Energy storage devices combining functionalities of battery electrodes and supercapacitor electrodes. *J Energy Storage* 134:118265. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.est.2025.118265>
33. Anjana P, Kumar SS, Rakhi R (2023a) MnCo₂S₄ nanoflowers directly grown over nickel foam as cathode for high-performance asymmetric hybrid supercapacitors. *J Energy Storage* 61:106672. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.est.2023.106672>
34. Anjana P, Kumar SS, Rakhi R (2023b) Direct growth of MnCoSe nanoneedles on 3D nickel foam for supercapacitor application. *Surfaces and Interfaces*. 42:103358. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.surfin.2023.103358>
35. Arévalo P, Tostado-Véliz M, Jurado F (2021) A novel methodology for comprehensive planning of battery storage systems. *J Energy Stor* 37:102456. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.est.2021.102456>
36. Durga IK, Kulurumotlakatla DK, Ramachandran T, Kumar YA, Reddy DA, Raghavendra K, Alothman AA, Rao SS (2023) Synergy unleashed: NiMoO₄/WO₃/NF nanoflowers elevate for supercapacitor performance. *J Phys Chem Solids* 186:111811. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpcs.2023.111811>
37. Khot S, Malavekar D, Bagwade P, Nikam R, Lokhande C (2023) Synthesis of reduced graphene oxide (rGO)/dysprosium selenide (Dy₂Se₃) composite electrode for energy storage; flexible asymmetric supercapacitor. *J Phys Chem Solids* 179:111419. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpcs.2023.111419>
38. Khot S, Malavekar D, Nikam R, Ubale S, Bagwade P, Patil D, Lokhande V, Lokhande C (2022) SILAR synthesized dysprosium selenide (Dy₂Se₃) thin films for hybrid electrochemical capacitors. *Synth Met* 287:117075. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.synthmet.2022.117075>
39. Fleischmann S, Mitchell JB, Wang R, Zhan C, Jiang D, Presser V, Augustyn V (2020) Pseudocapacitance: From fundamental understanding to high power energy storage materials. *Chem Rev* 120:146738–146782. <https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.chemrev.0c00170>
40. Maity CK, Acharya S, De S, Sahoo S, Kim MJ, Nayak GC (2025a) Boron nitride, a versatile nanostructure: Advances in synthesis, modifications, and energy storage applications. *Journal of Power Sources* 653:237759. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpowsour.2025.237759>
41. Maity CK, Kim M, Kim M, Kim MJ, Kim MJ (2025b) Tri-metal centers governed ZnCo oxide/HfO₂@bimetallic Ni-Pd alloy catalyst synthesized herringbone carbon nanofiber for supercapacitor electrode. *J Alloys Compd* 1031:181109. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jallcom.2025.181109>
42. Maity CK, Roy S, De Adhikari A, Kumari K, Kim MJ, Sahoo S, *Nanoscale* (2025c) 17(38), 22050–22085. <https://doi.org/10.1039/d5nr01892g>
43. Maity CK, Sood A, Singmar R, Choi JH, Milton A, Choi SM, Sahoo S, Han S, S (2025d) Reduced graphene oxide-supported microwave synthesis of Hemin-derived Fe₂O₃-based composites for advanced supercapacitor devices. *J Alloys Compd* 1014:178734. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jallcom.2025.178734>
44. Malavekar D, Magdum V, Khot S, Kim J, Lokhande C (2023a) Doping of rare earth elements: Towards enhancing the electrochemical performance of pseudocapacitive materials. *Journal of Alloys Compd* 960:170601. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jallcom.2023.170601>
45. Padmanathan N, Sellamuthu P (2020) Honeycomb micro/nano-architecture of stable β-NiMoO₄ nanosheets for high performance hybrid supercapacitor devices. *J Energy Storage*. <https://cora.ucc.ie/bitstreams/0634b340-8864-418a-95b4-0831289dc24b>
46. Li Y, Wang H, Liu P (2016) Facile one-pot synthesis of a NiMoO₄/reduced graphene oxide composite with superior electrochemical performance for supercapacitors. *RSC Adv* 6(82):78920–78928. <https://doi.org/10.1039/C6RA13955H>
47. Amisama A, Zhang L (2025) Introduction of MWCNTs-SH@Pd/NiMoO₄ as high performance counter electrode for Pt-free dye-sensitized solar cells. *J Alloys Compd*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jallcom.2025.179372>
48. Murugan E, Govindaraju S, Santhoshkumar S (2021) Hydrothermal synthesis, characterization and electrochemical behavior of NiMoO₄ nanoflower and NiMoO₄/rGO nanocomposite for high-performance supercapacitors. *Electrochim Acta* 385:138393. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.electacta.2021.138393>
49. Baby A, Narayanan BN (2024) Strategically designed multi-walled carbon nanotube/bismuth ferrite/polyaniline (MWCNT/BF/PANI) coral-like nanocomposite for high-performance supercapacitor. *Synth Met* 309:117761. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.synthmet.2024.117761>

Publisher's note Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Springer Nature or its licensor (e.g. a society or other partner) holds exclusive rights to this article under a publishing agreement with the author(s) or other rightsholder(s); author self-archiving of the accepted manuscript version of this article is solely governed by the terms of such publishing agreement and applicable law.